SOURCEBOOK ON

MEDICAL JURISPRUDENCE

Professor B.M. Dickens

1998-99

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
SOURCEBOOK ON

MEDICAL JURISPRUDENCE

Professor B.M. Dickens

1998-99

FACULTY OF LAW

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## PART I COURSE OUTLINE

## PART II REFERENCES

Bib 1-210

## PART III TEXTS

- Canadian Medical Protective Association: Revenue Statement and Statistical Summary............... 1
- Fee Schedule for 1996, The Canadian Medical Protective Association ........................................... 3
- Code of Ethics of the Canadian Medical Association ................................................................. 4
- The Medical Malpractice Problem in the United States and Canada ............................................. 6
- Patients' Interests and Clients' Wishes: Physicians and Lawyers in Discord ................................... 11
- Understanding Variations in What Doctors Do: Globe & Mail, November 22, 1993 ...................... 19
- Legal and Medical Professional Orientations .............................................................................. 20
- Can Doctors Serve as Double Agents? ......................................................................................... 26
- Implications of Health Professionals' Legal Liability ....................................................................... 28
- The Choice of Contrast Media: Medical, Ethical and Legal Considerations .............................. 34
- Adolescents and Medical Care Decisions .................................................................................... 38
- Legal Aspects of the Dementias .................................................................................................... 42
- Legal Limits of AIDS Confidentiality .......................................................................................... 45
- Confidentiality and the Duty to Warn .......................................................................................... 48
- From Letting Die to Inducing Death-The Legal Transition ....................................................... 57
- Case Comments: Medically Assisted Death: Nancy B v. Hôtel-Dieu de Québec ...................... 64
- When Terminally Ill Patients Request Death: Assisted Suicide before Canadian Courts ............ 82
- Abortion and Distortion of Justice in the Law ............................................................................. 87
- Legal Evolution of the Concept of Brain Death .......................................................................... 99
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Legal and Ethical Issues in Buying and Selling Organs</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morals and Markets in Transplantable Organs</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Who Legally Owns and Controls Human Organs after Procurement</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Living Tissue and Organ Donors and Property Law: More on Moore</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case Comment: Eve v. E</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Aspects of the Beginning of Human Life</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Issues in Embryo and Fetal Tissue Research and Therapy</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Ethics of Fetal-tissue Donation: Consensus and Contradiction</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proceed with Care: Final Report of the Royal Commission on New</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reproductive Technologies--Executive Summary</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proceed with Care: Media Summary</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maternal-Fetal Conflict</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Rights and Duties in the AIDS Epidemic</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPSO Reviews Policy on HIV Infected Physicians</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managing AIDS Patients</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some Legal and Ethical Implications of Genetic Predictability</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Issues in Predictive Genetic Testing Programs</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal and Ethical Issues in Genetic Testing and Counselling</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Choices, Control, Access -- The Canadian Position</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical Records - Patient's Right to Receive Copies -</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physician's Fiduciary Duty of Disclosure</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Toronto Centre for Bioethics - Living Will</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shattuck Lecture - Evaluating the Health Risks of Breast Implants:</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Interplay of Medical Science, The Law and Public Opinion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PART IV    LEGISLATION

Canada Health Act, Chapter C-6 .................................................................304
Ontario Human Tissue Gift Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. H20 ..................................311
Hospital Management, Regulation 965 of the Public Hospitals Act ............314
Health Care Consent Act 1996 .................................................................322
Regulated Health Professions Act (1991) (excerpt) ..................................349
Health Professions Procedural Code .........................................................353
PART I

COURSE OUTLINE

Medical Jurisprudence is offered as a lecture course, but its structure is kept loose in order to accommodate class discussion and/or seminar presentations from interested students. Students are encouraged, but not required, to give seminars; those writing term papers may find it useful to present their work in progress to the rest of the class for comment, perspective and provisional assessment. Evaluation in the course will be based on the term paper (which satisfies the law school's writing requirement), on a final examination or on a take-home assignment, at the student's option. In exceptional circumstances a longer term paper, for three hours' credit, can be arranged.

Students are advised to pay careful initial attention to the lists of recent articles that follow (Part II, infra.). They indicate significant topics addressed in the literature and the thematic dimensions of medical jurisprudence itself, disclosing well-trodden paths still worthy of pursuit, new matters coming to attention and points of interest available for further exploration. The whole list should be read soon after acquisition. It is divided into subject areas, but they are only general and provisional. Most articles affect a number of issues and may be of use in a number of differently directed studies.

A firm sequence of topics to be addressed in class cannot be predetermined; much will depend on the interests of class members and on the subjects chosen for any seminar presentations. The sequence below may, however, serve as a loose model.

- medical negligence and malpractice -- background issues
- malpractice litigation and the law
- informed patient decision-making
- medical treatment of minors
- confidentiality
- the right to die: natural death, non-treatment decisions (defective newborns, severely injured patients, etc.)
- legally protected life, wrongful birth and wrongful life
- criteria for the determination of death: brain death
- medical experimentation
- transplantation law and the control of body materials
- reproduction control, including contraception, sterilization and abortion
- reproduction promotion, including artificial insemination, "test tube" fertilization, surrogate motherhood and embryo transplantation
- acquired immunodeficiency syndrome (AIDS) and HIV infection
- genetic knowledge: developments, applications and implications
PART II

REFERENCES
REFERENCES

ARTICLES

For convenience, articles are grouped under nine topic headings, but **most articles are relevant to two or more headings**. A brief definition of the types of articles under each topic heading is provided below. However, reference to a specific subject should not be confined only to one topic heading. Articles preceded by the notation [incl.] are included in these materials.

**Topics**

1. **Standard of Care and Malpractice**: general articles on medicine and the law; types of liability and duty; who may be liable for malpractice.

2. **Consent**: the modern law of "informed consent; substitute consent; right to refuse treatment (excluding life-saving treatment); rights of minors; experimentation.

3. **Confidentiality**: access to medical records, immunity and privilege.

4. **Right to Die**: right to refuse life-saving treatment; euthanasia.

5. **Mental Health**: rights of the mentally incompetent; substitute consent; involuntary committal and sterilization; behaviour modification; psychiatric damage.

6. **Genetics and Eugenics**: policy proposals and legislation; population policy; "wrongful life" and "wrongful birth" actions.

7. **Time Factors**: Brain death; rights of the unborn; limitation periods; evidence.

8. **Biotechnology**: New reproductive technology; organ transplants; transsexual surgery; new microorganisms.

9. **Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome (AIDS)**
I. STANDARD OF CARE AND MALPRACTICE


20. T.K. Feng, “Failure of Medical Advice: Trespass or Negligence?” 7(2) Legal Studies 149-168.


29. H. Hahn, “Public Policy and Disabled Infants: A Sociopolitical Perspective” 3(1) Issues in Law & Med. 3-27.


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Journal/Volume/Issue/Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>69</td>
<td>K. Terrel</td>
<td>“St. Elizabeth Hospital v. Garrard: Case Comment”</td>
<td>29(2) South Texas Law Rev. 461-486.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Standard of Care: 1989/90 Supplement**


3. K. Blaner, “Physician, Heal Thyself: Because the Cure, the Health Care Quality Improvement Act, May be worse than the Disease” 37(4) Catholic Univ. Law Rev. (Summer 1988) 1073-1112


Standard of Care: 1990/91 Supplement


Bib - 6
Standard of Care: 1991/92 Supplement


Standard of Care: 1992/93 Supplement


Bib - 13


Standard of Care: 1993/94 Supplement


8. T.P. Hagen, “‘This May Sting A Little’ — A Solution to the Medical Malpractice Crisis Requires Insurers, Doctors, Patients and Lawyers to Take Their Medicine” XXVI(1) Suffolk Univ. L.R. (1992) 147-189.


**Standard of Care: 1994/95 Supplement**


Standard of Care: 1995/96 Supplement


23. M. Ennis & C. Vincent, “The Effects of Medical Accidents and Litigation on Doctors and Patients” 16(2) Law & Policy 97-121.


54. A. Leone, “Is ADR the Rx for Malpractice” Dispute Resolution J. (September 1994) 7-21.


77. P.D.G. Skegg, "Omissions to Provide Life-Prolonging Treatment" 8(2) Otago Law Rev. (1994) 205-238.


81. D. Truscott, "The psychotherapist’s duty to protect: an annotated bibliography" J. Psychiatry & Law (Summer 1993) 221-244.


Standard of Care: 1996/97 Supplement


42. J. Maurer, “Ohio Psychotherapist Civil Liability For Sexual Relations With Former Patients” 26(3) Univ. of Toledo L. Rev. (547-574).


Bib - 26


55. Reidinger, “Fraud Doctors A Revitalized False Claims Act is Proving to be a New Weapon for Health-Care Employees Who Blow the Whistle on Rip-Offs” ABA Journal (May 1996) 50-54.


Standard of Care: 1997/98 Supplement


Bib - 29


46. D.M. Kopstein, “Privilege Denied - Hospital Liability for Credentialing” May Trial (1997) 30-34.


Bib - 31


89. K. Williams, “Making Rules for Occupational Health in Britain, The USA and the EC” Anglo-American L. Rev. 82-110.

Standard of Care: 1998/99 Supplement


47. I.B. McKenna, "Legal Rights for Persons with Disabilities in Canada: Can the Impasse Be Resolved?" 29(1) Ottawa L.R. 153-213.
II. **CONSENT**


Consent: 1989/90 Supplement


15. C. Kazin, “Nowhere to Go and Choose to Stay’: Using the Tort of False Imprisonment To Redress Involuntary Confinement of the Elderly in Nursing Homes and Hospitals” 137 (3) Univ. of Penn. Law Rev. (Jan. 1989) 903-927.


Consent: 1990/91 Supplement


Bib - 41


Consent: 1991/92 Supplement


Bib - 42


Consent: 1992/93 Supplement


11. J. Eekelaar, "The Importance of Thinking that Children Have Rights" 6(1) Int'l J. of Law and the Family (1992) 221-244.


Consent: 1993/94 Supplement


5. B.M. Dickens, Human Rights in Medical Experimentation” in General Problems of Human Rights ??


Consent: 1994/95 Supplement


31. Susan J. Steinle, “Living Wills in the United States and Canada: A Comparative Analysis” 24(2) Case Western


189-198.


36. Karin E. Wilinski, “Involuntary Contraceptive Measures: Controlling Women at the Expense of Human

Consent: 1995/96 Supplement

1. A. Arabian, “Informed Consent: From the Ambivalence of Arato to the Thunder of Thor” 10(3) Issues in Law,


4. R.H. Blank, “International Symposium on Critically Ill Newborns: An Overview and Introduction” 16(2) J.
Legal Medicine (1995) 183-188.

5. D. Brake, “Legal Challenges to the Educational Barriers Facing Pregnant and Parenting Adolescents” 28(2)


8. D.M. Cocchetto, “Practical Considerations in Direct Interactions Between Sponsors and Institutional Review
Boards” 49(1) Food & Drug L.J. (1994) 77-88.


975-1016.


Consent: 1996/97 Supplement


Bib - 52


Consent: 1997/98 Supplement


Consent: 1998/99 Supplement


III. CONFIDENTIALITY


11. B.S. Murphy, B.S., “How to Protect Employees Who are Tested for Drug and Alcohol Abuse” 33(1) The Practical Lawyer 27-40.


Confidentiality: 1989/90 Supplement


Confidentiality: 1990/91 Supplement


Confidentiality: 1991/92 Supplement


5. R. Slovenko, “The Therapist’s Duty to Warn or Protect Third Persons” J. Psychiatry & Law (Spring 1988) 139-209.


Confidentiality: 1992/93 Supplement


Confidentiality: 1993/94 Supplement


Bib - 63


Confidentiality: 1994/95 Supplement


Confidentiality: 1995/96 Supplement


Confidentiality: 1996/97 Supplement


Confidentiality: 1997/98 Supplement


Confidentiality: 1998/99 Supplement


IV. **RIGHT TO DIE**


Bib - 69


Right to Die: 1989/90 Supplement


Right to Die: 1990/91 Supplement


Bib - 72


Right to Die: 1991/92 Supplement


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Title and Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>


Right to Die: 1992/93 Supplement


27. J. Kevorkian, “A Fail-Safe Model for Justifiable Medically-Assisted Suicide (‘Medicide’)” 13(1) Amer. J. of Forensic Psychiatry (1992) 7-41. (Commentaries on Dr. Kevorkian’s Article infra, 43-81.)


**Right to Die: 1993/94 Supplement**


Bib - 78


Bib - 80


Right to Die: 1994/95 Supplement


Right to Die: 1995/96 Supplement


Bib - 83


Right to Die: 1997/98 Supplement

Bib - 86


Right to Die: 1998/99 Supplement


V. MENTAL HEALTH


Mental Health: 1989/90 Supplement


Bib - 91

Mental Health: 1990/91 Supplement


**Mental Health: 1991/92 Supplement**


Mental Health: 1992/93 Supplement


**Mental Health: 1993/94 Supplement**


**Mental Health: 1994/95 Supplement**


Mental Health: 1995/96 Supplement


**Mental Health: 1996/97 Supplement**


Bib - 100


Mental Health: 1997/98 Supplement


Mental Health: 1998/99 Supplement


17. A. Sprince, “Negligently Inflicted Psychiatric Damage: A Medical Diagnosis and Prognosis” Legal Studies.


VI. GENETICS AND EUGENICS


Genetics and Eugenics: 1989/90 Supplement


30. R. Macklin, "Is There Anything Wrong with Surrogate Motherhood?: An Ethical Analysis" 16(1-2) Law, Med. & Health Care (1988) 57-64.

Bib - 106

Genetics and Eugenics: 1990/91 Supplement


Bib - 107


Genetics and Eugenics: 1991/92 Supplement


<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Genetics and Eugenics: 1992/93 Supplement


Bib - 110


Genetics and Eugenics: 1993/94 Supplement


Bib - 112


**Genetics and Eugenics: 1994/95 Supplement**


**Genetics and Eugenics: 1995/96 Supplement**


Bib - 113


Bib - 114

24. P. Mostow, "'Like Building on Top of Auschwitz': On the Symbolic Meaning of Using Data from the Nazi Experiments, and on Non-use as a Form of Memorial" 10(2) J. Law & Religion 403-31.


Genetics and Eugenics: 1996/97 Supplement


Genetics and Eugenics: 1997/98 Supplement


Bib - 117
Genetics and Eugenics: 1998/99 Supplement


Bib - 118

20. G. Wei, “Inventions, Genes and Napoleonic Victories” 9 Singapore Academy of L. J. (March 1997) 1-34.

VII. **TIME FACTORS**


5. V.L. Bor, “Fetal Protection Policies & Title VII” 2(4) The Labor Lawyer 683-693.


26. C. Overall, "Pluck a Fetus from its Womb: A Critique of Current Attitudes Toward the Embryo/Fetus" 84(1) Univ. of Western Ont. Law Rev. 1-14.


**Time Factors: 1989/90 Supplement**


Bib - 121

Time Factors: 1990/91 Supplement


Bib - 123


**Time Factors: 1991/92 Supplement**


Bib - 126


49. C.L. Neff, "Woman, Womb and Bodily Integrity" 3(2) Yale J. Law & Feminism (1991) 327-353.


Time Factors: 1992/93 Supplement


Time Factors: 1993/94 Supplement


Bib - 129


Time Factors: 1994/95 Supplement


Time Factors: 1995/96 Supplement


Time Factors: 1996/97 Supplement


Time Factors: 1997/98 Supplement


Time Factors: 1998/99 Supplement


VIII. **BIOTECHNOLOGY**


10. R.S. Eisenberg, “Proprietary Rights and the Norms of Science in Biotechnology Research” 97(2) Yale Law J. 177-231.


Bib - 135


**Biotechnology: 1989/90 Supplement**


Biotechnology: 1990/91 Supplement


Bib - 139


**Biotechnology: 1991/92 Supplement**


Bib - 141


**Biotechnology: 1992/93 Supplement**


53. J. Swaigen, “Negligence, Reverse Onuses and Environmental Offences: Some Practical Considerations” 2(2) J. of Environmental Law & Practice 149-188.

Biotechnology: 1993/94 Supplement


37. A. Wertheimer, “Two Questions about Surrogacy and Exploitation” 21(3) Phil. and Pub. Affairs 211-239.
Biotechnology: 1994/95 Supplement


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Volume and Page Numbers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>John A. Robertson</td>
<td>&quot;Posthumous Reproduction&quot;</td>
<td>69(4) Indiana L.J. (1994) 1027-1065,</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Biotechnology: 1995/96 Supplement


Bib - 155

Bib - 156


Biotechnology: 1997/98 Supplement


Bib - 157
<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>


Biotechnology: 1998/99 Supplement


IX. ACQUIRED IMMUNODEFICIENCY SYNDROME (AIDS)


**Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome (AIDS): 1989/90 Supplement**


Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome (AIDS): 1990/91 Supplement


Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome (AIDS): 1991/92 Supplement


46. L.A. Polito, “Containing the AIDS Virus...Testing... Reporting...Confidentiality...Constitutional Considerations” 37(2) Cleveland State Law Rev. (1990) 369-392.

Bib - 171


Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome (AIDS): 1992/93 Supplement


**Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome (AIDS): 1993/94 Supplement**


Bib - 174
Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome (AIDS): 1994/95 Supplement


Bib - 175


Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome (AIDS): 1995/96 Supplement


Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome (AIDS): 1996/97 Supplement


Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome (AIDS): 1997/98 Supplement


